

ARTSALIVE!

A CULTURAL ARTS PLAN FOR LIVERMORE

June 2007

ARTSALIVE!

[HTTP://WWW.CI.LIVERMORE.CA.US/ARTSALIVE/INDEX.HTML](http://WWW.CI.LIVERMORE.CA.US/ARTSALIVE/INDEX.HTML)

THE CULTURAL+PLANNING GROUP
DAVID PLETTNER, PRINCIPAL
101 NORTH GRAMERCY PLACE
LOS ANGELES, CA 90004
213-500-6692
WWW.CULTURALPLANNING.COM

JERRY ALLEN AND ASSOCIATES
JERRY ALLEN, PRINCIPAL
444 HOOVER ROAD
SOQUEL, CA 95073
831-465-1953
JALLEN9876@AOL.COM

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Definition of Cultural Arts.....	ii
I. Executive Summary	1
Belief and Mission Statements.....	7
II. Strategies	8
Strand 1: Unique sense of place in Livermore	9
Strand 2: Visibility and vitality of cultural arts for all in Livermore.....	13
Strand 3: Diverse range of publicly accessible arts opportunities	16
Strand 4: Long-term, sustainable resources	22
III. Implementation.....	25
Two-year Action Plan	25
Primary Implementing Agencies	26
IV. Planning Context.....	29
Profile of the City of Livermore.....	29
Relevant Plans and Studies	30
Multi-City Comparative Study of Arts Funding	43
V. Appendices	46
Public Art Policy	46
Acknowledgments	57
Planning Participants	58
Planning Methodology.....	61

Definition of Cultural Art

In April 2007, during a public workshop that introduced Livermore's draft cultural arts master plan, artsALIVE!, a resident requested that the plan include a definition of cultural arts. The definition and descriptions from the Public Art Policy follow:

Culture (from the Latin *cultura* stemming from *colere*, meaning "to cultivate"), generally refers to patterns of human activity and the symbolic structures that give such activity significance. Different definitions of "culture" reflect different theoretical bases for understanding, or criteria for evaluating, human activity. Most generally, the term *culture* denotes the whole make up of an individual, group or society of intelligent beings. It includes technology, art, science, as well as moral systems and the characteristic behaviors and habits of the selected intelligent entities. In particular, it has specific more detailed meanings in different domains of human activities.*

The term **art** is used to describe a particular type of creative production generated by human beings, and the term usually implies some degree of aesthetic value. An artist makes a work of art for various purposes, such as creating an experience for others. There is no general agreed-upon definition of art, since defining the boundaries of "art" is subjective, but the impetus for art is often called human creativity.* Some examples as described in the Public Art Ordinance include:

- Art works created for specific locations
- Exhibitions, events, performances, temporary exhibits, and/or art work installations located in a public space.
- Art works produced through involvement of the community
- Integration of art and architecture to enhance the design of urban or public spaces
- Collaboration of artists, architects or urban designers to create unique physical environments or features which integrates art into the urban fabric of the city.

Mediums include (but are not limited to) sculpture, murals, glass or water features, landscaping, uniquely designed or site specific paving, furniture and parts of buildings, sound and light works, organic form, works that may decompose or melt, memorabilia or ceremonial objects related to civic activities.

* Wikipedia, *The Free Encyclopedia*

I. ARTSALIVE! FOR LIVERMORE: EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The community of Livermore, through its Commission for the Arts, has created this ambitious and visionary plan—artsALIVE!—to chart Livermore’s arts and cultural development in the coming ten years. The plan has been developed from the community’s expression of its cultural identity, needs, priorities, assets, aspirations and unique opportunities.

In 2004, the Livermore City Council recognized that the established and growing cultural arts organizations, artists and arts educators of the City made important contributions to the City’s quality of life, economic vitality, education system, and strong, diversifying communities. They created the Livermore Commission for the Arts and mandated the Commissioners to help the City “encourage programs for the cultural enrichment of the City; make recommendations to the City Council regarding local cultural arts needs, activities, facilities and programs, including needs for visual and performing arts facilities; receive input from the community on issues relevant to arts policies; develop and recommend to the City Council a 5-10 year cultural arts plan for the City, including goals, implementation strategies and financing methods; and review and approve public art.”

During its first meetings, the newly-created Livermore Commission for the Arts invested several months determining the shared values that brought the Commissioners to dedicate their time to the arts in Livermore. The resulting Belief and Mission Statements (see page 8) provide the organizing principals of this ambitious Cultural Arts Plan. The hope and expectation is that a lively conversation, and shared commitment to action, will continue among the leaders, residents and businesses who contribute to making Livermore the evolving, dynamic city it is and will continue to be for generations to come.

Strategies for Development of Livermore’s Arts and Culture

Four strands of engagement are proposed to further enhance Livermore’s art and cultural activities for all residents and to establish Livermore as the premier destination in the Tri-Valley region. Recommendations were created in response to community member input through interviews and workshops held in the development of this plan, and the Commissioners analysis of the City’s current needs and capacities for growth. These recommendations are supported by research, strategies and recommendations made in related City plans such as the Updated General Plan, Redevelopment Agency 5 Year Implementation Plan, Downtown Specific Plan, the Marketing Communications and Partnership Strategy and the Visioning process. The following are the proposed areas of action for the Livermore Commission for the Arts, the City Council, and those who care about the quality of life made visible through cultural arts engagement throughout the City:

- Strand 1: Promote the ***unique sense of place in Livermore***, including the creation of a Cultural Arts District
- Strand 2: Ensure the ***visibility and vitality of cultural arts organizations, artists and arts educators for all residents and visitors to the City*** through facilitation of partnerships and support for organizational strengthening within the arts, culture and heritage communities

- Strand 3: Leverage the innate ability of arts engagement to create a sense of community and life-long learning by supporting ***a diverse range of publicly accessible opportunities*** for all residents, businesses and visitors to participate, with a special focus on youth
- Strand 4: Provide long-term, sustainable resources that enable the City to support the arts and culture community as a resource for all residents, visitors and businesses.

Strand 1: Promote the ***unique sense of place in Livermore***, including the creation of a Cultural Arts District

The downtown core in Livermore is rapidly becoming the cultural hub of the City. Designation of the core as a Cultural Arts District (District) can serve to reinforce the City's new marketing identity and encourage the retention and attraction of artists and arts-related businesses, thereby expanding and reinforcing the City's economic development goals. The establishment of a Cultural District that is home to diverse public activities meets expectations integrated in the strands of this plan by expanding residents' access to quality arts and cultural programming, serving visitors, and strengthening the arts and culture community ,

Specific recommendations associated with development of the Cultural Arts District over a planned period of implementation and on a resources-available model are to:

1. Create a Cultural Arts District,
2. Develop and expand arts and cultural facilities and spaces in the District in the first 3 - 5 years and expand into other areas of the city in subsequent years as funding allows,
3. Support and provide seed funding for arts and cultural programming, with an emphasis on partnerships and accessibility (including widely dissemination marketing, free or affordable ticket pricing, diversity in offerings, time, and place of events),
4. Facilitate the provision of support services for arts, heritage and cultural organizations and related businesses (see more on this in Strand 2 below), and
5. Establish sustainable infrastructure and systems to manage and program the District, develop private funds, and provide other related services (more on this in Strand 4).

Strand 2: Ensure the *visibility and vitality of cultural arts organizations, artists and arts educators for all residents and visitors to the City*

through facilitation of partnerships and support for organizational strengthening within the arts, culture and heritage communities

Strengthening Livermore's many arts and cultural organizations was a consistent theme emerging from community input and analysis done for this plan. While some of these organizations are long-standing and well-established, nearly all have small budgets and rely heavily on volunteer management. They identify common needs for better coordination, funding, marketing (including ticketing services and calendar information), an expanded, better trained volunteer base, and facilities or space.

When a nonprofit organization is strengthened, it is better equipped to fulfill its mission, thereby strengthening the overall environment for growing the arts and culture community.

Specific recommendations encourage two ways of supporting organizational strengthening toward better visibility and vitality for Livermore's arts community: a) assisting individual organizations and b) fostering stronger community linkages among these organizations and between the arts and culture community and the wider community. Recognizing that implementation is dependent upon developing appropriate resources over time, it is recommendation that the City research and be alert to opportunities to:

1. Provide operating and project grants for organizations and individual artists,
2. Create or support an organizational strengthening program for nonprofit arts and culture organizations, and
3. Facilitate access to capital grants program for nonprofit cultural arts culture organizations.

Strand 3: Leverage the innate ability of cultural arts engagement to create a sense of community and life-long learning by supporting *a diverse range of publicly accessible opportunities* for all residents, businesses and visitors to participate, with a special focus on youth

Rooted in the belief that art-making bonds communities, encourages individual expression, and celebrates the human spirit, the Commissioners and community forum participants demonstrated a strong consensus that ALL residents of Livermore have a right to experience the arts in their daily lives. This belief is embodied in the Public Art plan calling for works of art and opportunities for arts engagement in strategic Livermore locations. And it is reinforced in the recommendation to ensure wide public access to arts engagement for the many diverse communities of Livermore, including widely disseminated marketing, free or affordable ticket pricing, diversity in offerings, access for the disabled and the time and place of quality events.

*"Art introduces a whole new element for our business."**

* This is the first of several quotes inserted throughout the plan from various interviewees.

Greater access to cultural arts activities deepens and expands cultural participation among all segments of the community and builds on the unique qualities of Livermore. It also provides many community benefits, such as adding value to the lives of individual residents, improving education, inviting life-long learning, promoting economic development, and supporting downtown revitalization.

The specific recommendations facilitating access for participation are to:

1. Convene youth service providers and organizers throughout the City to evaluate and create opportunities for youth access to the arts and arts learning in and outside of school settings, in families, and in the juvenile justice system,
2. Facilitate creation of a downtown arts and culture festival, building upon existing opportunities and seeking partnerships for new arts engagements,
3. Encourage cultural events and opportunities for youth and young adults, including seeking mechanisms for mini-grants to cultural arts organizations, artists and their public and private partners,
4. Enhance implementation of the public art program, building on the current program vision of the Commission for the Arts,
5. Create arts and culture education partnerships with the Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District and Livermore Area Recreation & Park District, and Las Positas Community College, and
6. Develop a communitywide arts and culture marketing program (this also supports Strand 2).

Strand 4: Provide **long-term, sustainable resources** that enable the City to support the arts, heritage and culture communities as a resource for all residents, visitors and business.

A study of 11 nearby cities with characteristics similar to Livermore shows that on average these cities currently devote \$4.16 per citizen per year to support arts and cultural activities (Dublin is at \$10/citizen and Walnut Creek is at a high of \$27). In comparison, Livermore spent between \$11 and \$12 per citizen over the last three years. Livermore has the opportunity to establish itself as center for arts and cultural engagement that will attract and sustain residents, business and families committed to creative, safe, tolerant and innovative communities.

"I like the idea of a workplace giving program – I think it would fly."

Livermore has only recently begun to use arts and culture as part of its long-term economic development strategy and devote substantial resources to that end, primarily in the form of support for the new performing arts center. Those seeking to do business in Livermore can recognize that public and private investments in the City's arts infrastructure is a benefit to all. Commitment to cultural arts facilitates 1) improvements to the quality of education (improved education systems that attract employees with families), 2) development of a creative workforce invested in the community, and 3)

caring communities that meet and grow at public arts events. A sufficient and sustainable level of support for Livermore's arts and culture is an essential component of successful implementation.

The specific resource development recommendations are to:

1. Adopt a private development cultural arts enhancement fee (Art in Public Places)
2. Consider increasing the City's cultural arts staff, as funding is available
3. Create a united arts fund
4. Create a workplace giving program
5. Create a permanent endowment fund

Context and Planning Process

Livermore has a well-established and distinctive cultural identity. The city is home to an unusually large and diverse collection of cultural arts organizations and other cultural assets, including a symphony, opera, dance company, theater festival, chamber music series, performing arts center, poet laureate, organizations for visual arts, literary arts, vocal music, film, TV 30, heritage groups, arts educators, artisans and many individual artists. In addition, the community identifies with its Western heritage and its long history of agriculture including wine making, as well as the presence since the 1950's of the prestigious Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory and Sandia National Laboratory, two of the world's foremost scientific research facilities with more than 10,000 employees. Taken together, this combination of arts, culture, heritage, viticulture and science form a rich identity and way of life that is clearly acknowledged and celebrated by the community. artsALIVE! is based on this diverse and inclusive community sensibility of its own culture.

"Culture is how we live – the arts plan must reflect the changing nature of the community – ethnicity, culture, food, and our stories."

The purpose of the planning process for artsALIVE! was to allow the community to define its own cultural future. This involved an intensive and interactive community input process in which stakeholders not only expressed their opinions but also reflected on Livermore's identity and future options. The planning process included:

- Review of relevant plans and studies
- Community workshops, town hall meetings and interviews with stakeholders
- Comparative study of arts funding in comparable cities
- Development of a comprehensive plan
- Public review and analysis of the draft recommendations for final recommendation by the Livermore Commission for the Arts

Implementation

Implementation of this plan will occur as funds are available. As with all ambitious City plans, implementation must be flexible to allow the City and its implementing partners to respond to changing circumstances and new opportunities. It is recommended that the Commission reviews and makes annual recommendations to implement the plan. Some implementation costs can be estimated now while others must be defined in the future. Funding is anticipated through a variety of strategies outlined above, including a fee on private development. These funds would be augmented by private fundraising, volunteer services, and by the efforts and spending of partner agencies.

Connections to City Council and resident goals

Economic trends demonstrate that local economies depend greatly upon the creative and intellectual capital of their citizenry. To cultivate this capital, the City needs to nurture a cultural climate that will attract a creative and diverse workforce and to ensure that all residents have access to participate in arts and cultural activities. To this end, the Livermore City Council has made arts and culture a priority.

In their *Goals and Objectives for 2006-2008*, the Council has made a commitment to make Livermore a destination for cultural arts activities. The Council adopted its Downtown Specific Plan in February 2004, and created the Commission for the Arts later that year to support implementation of aspects of that plan. With vision, passion and dedication, the people of Livermore will be able to speak with additional pride of the beauty, humanity and natural harmony of the place they have chosen to call home. Their engagement with arts and arts learning will be a visible indication of their commitment to build on the innate possibilities of living in this unique community.

Livermore Commission for the Arts Belief and Mission Statements:

As the Livermore Commission for the Arts, we believe Livermore is a unique community of possibilities deeply rooted in a sense of history with a vision for the future. We believe that access to and engagement in the arts is essential to the continuing vitality of Livermore.

We value our natural environment, recognize our dependence on its gifts, and honor it through creative interactions.

We believe engagement in the arts enriches our community, enabling us to embrace and appreciate diversity and individual expression.

"We need to make people aware of opportunities and welcome them with open arms and be open to new ideas."

We invite all to participate in the arts and celebrate in our collective human experience.

The Livermore Commission for the Arts is committed to:

- Facilitating and convening partnerships and collaborations for the arts among city entities and community organizations, including mentoring, using creativity as a positive force and expanding the arts community in Livermore.
- Promoting the unique sense of place inherent in Livermore through developing a vibrant arts community.
- Ensuring publicly accessible arts events.
- Advocating the integration and presence of the arts in community design and other city activities.
- Developing and expanding opportunities for arts and cultural learning, growth and creativity for people of all ages, with an emphasis on children and youth.

"The arts really tie the community together."

II. STRATEGIES

The following strategies for Livermore's arts and cultural development are based on the community research and comparisons undertaken during this planning process, including the relevant plans and studies that preceded the start of this plan. There are four overall strategies (in no order of priority):

- **Strand 1:** Promote the ***unique sense of place in Livermore***, including the creation of Cultural Arts District,
- **Strand 2:** Ensure the ***visibility and vitality of cultural arts organizations, artists and arts educators for all residents and visitors to the City*** through facilitation of partnerships and support for organizational strengthening within the arts, culture and heritage communities,
- **Strand 3:** Leverage the innate ability of arts engagement to create a sense of community and life-long learning by supporting ***a diverse range of publicly accessible opportunities*** for all residents, businesses and visitors to participate, with a special focus on youth, and
- **Strand 4:** Provide long-term, sustainable resources that enable the City to support the arts, heritage and culture communities as a resource for all residents, visitors and business.

Each strategy contains a description of its context, including findings from the research and a rationale. Each also contains recommendations for implementation.

Strand 1: Promote the *unique sense of place in Livermore*, including the creation of a Cultural Arts District

Context

Downtown Livermore is rapidly becoming the cultural hub of the City and, in some respects, the Tri-Valley region. A new 500-seat performing arts center is under construction. In front of this theater will be a plaza and amphitheater for outdoor performances. Plans have been developed for an additional 1,800-seat theater, for which a site (including former SBC building) has been identified. Extensive upgrades to First Street have been completed. The City is currently working with a private developer to create a mixed use development on the former Lucky Supermarket site (Livermore Village). This development will include 25 affordable live-work-retail units with artists and arts-related businesses in mind. Also included in the plan will be a 5,000 – 7,500 square foot arts space that could be used as workshop space, a gallery or classroom for arts related activities. In the interior of the site will be a small outdoor performance space.

The downtown core is already zoned for arts-related businesses and activities. Quality restaurants are being established, two wineries have downtown tasting rooms and higher end retail businesses have started opening with more expected to follow.

Recommendations for capitalizing on existing and planned City actions

□ Create a Cultural Arts District

The consultants recommend an Arts and Cultural District in the downtown Livermore area be formally designated.

This will produce a number of positive benefits for the City.

It will reinforce the City's new marketing identity, which includes the development of Livermore as a center for arts and culture. It will expand citizens' access to quality arts and cultural programming, and promote cultural tourism. It will encourage the retention and attraction of artists and arts-related businesses, thereby reinforcing the City's economic development goals.

"In Livermore, there is a level for each person to enter the cultural world at their own level of development."

If bounded by Railroad Avenue on the north, Maple Street on the east, 4th Street on the south and "P" Street on the west, the Cultural District could be large enough to encompass many existing and planned cultural assets, and yet also be walkable and pedestrian friendly. A signage and banner program would give the District a clear visual identity. Future expansions of the District could accommodate additional parking and cultural facility development. Zoning in the District should include a focus to permit arts and cultural uses that embrace a broad definition of culture.

□ Develop and expand arts and cultural facilities and spaces in the District in the first 3 - 5 years and expand into other areas of the city in subsequent years as funding allows

Livermore has an abundance of existing and potential arts and cultural facilities to support and enhance the proposed Cultural Arts District. The following is a list of those and other facilities, to be explored for expansion or future use:

- 500-seat Performing Arts Center: under construction, to be completed in September, 2007.
- 1800-seat Performing Arts Center: Initial planning complete, with efforts to identify necessary funding underway. The SBC building at South Livermore Avenue and Second Street has been purchased by the City as part of the future site of the proposed 1800-seat theater.
- Livermore Village development: Ground breaking is scheduled for 2007 on this new development. Current discussions include dedicating 25 units as affordable live-work spaces for artists and arts-related businesses, as well as a 5,000 to 7,500 square foot space that could be used as classroom space, workshops and gallery space. There is also a small band shell planned for construction in the interior courtyard of the new development.
- Carnegie Library: Currently home to the Heritage Guild and the Livermore Art Association.
- Train Depot: This historic structure is currently located on the Livermore Village site. Discussions concerning relocation are underway with various groups including the Livermore Heritage Guild.
- Plaza in front of the 500-seat Performing Arts Center: Scheduled for completion in May 2007. It includes a small amphitheater suitable for small scale performances.
- Livermore Civic Center Library: Outside the District boundaries, and currently used for arts exhibits, including Livermore Lives: Teen Art contest and exhibit Newcott-Caldeberry Book Writing and Illustrating Contest; Family Story time; and an Author and Arts series which shows independent films, documentaries and live presentations.
- Bothwell Center: This facility, located several blocks south of the proposed Arts and Culture District, is operated by the Livermore Valley Performing Arts Center, under a contract with the Park District. The building houses many cultural arts activities as it is being renovated to become a multi-use cultural center, with a small theater, studio and classroom spaces.

Establish sustainable infrastructure and systems to manage and program the District, develop private funds, and provide other related services

The Arts and Cultural District will require oversight and management. It is recommended that several strategies be researched and evaluated for providing this key service, including facilitation of a partnership of existing organizations, the institution of a new management team or organization, and other possibilities that may develop as the

District grows. As resources are developed, this infrastructure system might take a range of responsibilities, which could include:

- Coordination of the downtown Arts and Culture District, including administering an artist-in-residence program and programming of the downtown artist spaces and galleries, and exploration of expanding an existing art festival in the downtown or developing a new one
- Programming of the plaza in front of new theater
- Street artist coordination and permitting
- Coordination of a communitywide arts marketing program, with monthly and quarterly coordination meetings between various local and regional marketing entities
- Leadership and volunteer development and training
- Creation of a United Arts Fund and/or creation of a workplace giving program to encourage support of arts and culture for private businesses, corporations and individuals (see Strand 4 for more on this)

Initial seed funding for oversight would likely need to come from contracts for services to the City. Additional fundraising, especially in grant requests to outside public and private agencies and foundations, would be essential to the success of the oversight team. The long-term goal would be for the oversight infrastructure process to become partly or fully self-sufficient, depending on success of its fundraising and the level of services contracted on behalf of the City.

Staffing would depend upon the structure of the oversight mechanism; a partnership might include Letters of Agreement for services to the City divided among participating organizations, with a lead Agency taking primary responsibility for reporting and accountability, while a new organizational structure would require accountable leadership, support staff and eventually program and fundraising managers for long-term sustainability.

□ Support and provide seed funding for arts and cultural programming, with an emphasis on partnerships and accessibility (including widely disseminated marketing, free or affordable ticket pricing, diversity in offerings and the time and place of events)

As the level of arts and cultural activities grow over time in the Arts and Culture District, required City support will decrease. The City could provide initial support through contracts or small grants for arts programming in the District that recognizes other aspects of the culture of Livermore, its history of ranching and wine-making and the extraordinary connections to the Lawrence Livermore and Sandia National Laboratories. For example, plans are underway for a lecture series by the scientists from the labs in the new 500-seat theater.

A variety of strategies should be considered to develop regular, accessible, high-quality arts programming in the District, establishing it as an active hub of arts programming and

cultural opportunities. These strategies should include, but not be limited to these considerations:

- The 500-seat theater is likely to be heavily used, but the outdoor spaces will require proactive efforts on the part of the entity managing the District to attract artists and audiences,
- Regular programming in the theater plaza and the future outdoor space in the Livermore Village development and new festivals elsewhere could be developed and encouraged through City services and minimal or no permit fees,
- Street artists could be permitted and even encouraged through modest honoraria to be paid to the artists,
- Programming targeted at youth and young adults could be emphasized (see Strand 2 for more),
- Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory over the years has considered relocating its Discovery Center into a downtown facility. Increased activities in the downtown may further enhance the opportunities to relocate the Discovery Center, and
- Walking tours of Livermore's historic architecture, such as those developed by the Heritage Guild, should be expanded.

Facilitate the provision of support services for arts, heritage and cultural organizations and related businesses (see more on this in Strand 2 below)

Special efforts could be directed to supporting the artists and arts-related businesses that will occupy the Livermore Village development. To attract and retain artists and businesses, the City will eventually need to offer support services that will give Livermore a competitive advantage over other arts-focused communities like Emeryville or Berkeley. These support services might include creation of an exhibition gallery, communal workshop space and marketing assistance as described throughout the Plan.

Summary of Recommendations for Strand One: Unique Sense of Place

1. Formalize the creation of a Cultural Arts District by action of the City Council.
2. Continue to develop arts and culture related facilities and spaces in the District.
3. Ensure oversight of the District and develop long-term private funding.
4. Support and provide initial seed funding to facilitate arts and cultural programming in the District.
5. Develop a package of support services for the artists and arts-related businesses the City hopes to attract and retain.

Strand 2: Ensure the *visibility and vitality of cultural arts organizations, artists and arts educators for all residents and visitors to the City* through facilitation of partnerships and support for organizational strengthening within the arts, culture and heritage communities

Context

Visible, vital cultural arts organizations are often the first entry point for residents and visitors to learn of the vitality of the community as a whole. Stronger cultural arts organizations create greater visibility, connect for longer lasting vitality, and provide employment, engagement, meaning and balance for those who participate.

Strengthening Livermore's many arts and cultural organizations is a key strategy to creating the visibility and vitality the City deserves. Livermore is home to an unusually large and diverse collection of organizations and other cultural assets, including a symphony, opera, dance companies, theater festival, chamber music series, performing arts center, poet laureate, organizations for visual arts, literary arts, film, TV 30, vocal music, heritage groups, arts educators, artisans, and many individual artists. While some of these organizations are long-standing and well-established, nearly all have small budgets and rely heavily on volunteer management. They identify common needs for better coordination, funding, marketing (including ticketing services and calendar information), an expanded, better trained volunteer base, and facilities or space.

When a nonprofit organization is strengthened, it is better equipped to fulfill its mission, thereby strengthening the overall environment for growing the arts and culture community.

The value of such strengthening has been demonstrated in national studies, such as "Sustaining Nonprofit Performance: The Case for Capacity Building and the Evidence to Support It" (Paul C. Light, Brookings Institution Press 2004). This study concludes that nonprofits that invest in technology, training, and strategic planning successfully advance their goals. The needs vary widely among organizations and program needs from flexible and highly customized to the specific needs of a given organization. Such a program could support management improvements, strategic planning and implementation, research, staff positions, and program expenses that will enhance organizational sustainability.

For Livermore, supporting programs could be approached in two ways:

1. Assisting individual organizations and
2. Fostering stronger community linkages among these organizations, and between the arts and culture community and the wider community.

Healthy arts ecology requires attention to both individual artists and nonprofit organizations. Livermore has a relatively strong and diverse representation of both, and strengthening both together would greatly help the extended arts communities.

Livermore's arts and culture organizations are in fact under-funded and need additional funding for general operations or to sustain or grow their program services to the community.

Similarly, individual artists and artisans lack access to funding and other support for their work or projects.

"The critical issues for individual artists in Livermore are creating a sense of community, studio and live-work space, exhibition space and classroom space."

It should be noted that arts and cultural organizations are eligible for funding through the City's Tourism and Special Event Grant program, in effect since 1992. The program provides financial support for community activities associated with downtown, the wine country, arts, and cultural events that generate tourism in the community. Grants may be used for event performance expenses, including rental fees, advertising, transportation, safety and security, rental of equipment, and miscellaneous supplies. The total amount of funding available was recently increased by Council from \$15,000 to \$30,000.

As part of organizational strengthening, organizations could be encouraged to meet their own facility needs. Many issues of arts facility and space needs are addressed in Strand One (page 10). The LVPAC's new 500-seat theater opening in 2007 will also help meet many--but not all-- of the community's cultural facilities needs. A capital grants program would provide matching funds as effective incentives to nonprofit arts and culture organizations for capital projects such as building project planning, design, purchase, construction, expansion, renovation, tenant improvements, major equipment purchase, cash reserve or endowment. This type of project requires organizations to define their own facility or space needs, plan a project, and make a compelling case to the community to help fund it. All these tasks require significant organizational capacities, so groups that can successfully plan and fund a capital project have by definition built greater organizational capacity.

Recommendations

Provide operating and project grants for organizations and individual artists

An annual project grants program could fund nonprofit arts and culture organizations to provide specific activities or programs to the community, or could provide a modest amount of critically needed general operating support. The program should define clear standards of accountability for grantees, including specific services to the community and standards of programmatic and organizational quality. Peer review, with professional staff oversight, is the most effective and commonly used process for selecting grantees, including making subtle judgments of artistic quality and community impact required in selection processes. With sufficient accountability, these grants can be made on a multi-year basis, to achieve administrative efficiency and lower the cost of managing the program.

In addition to funding organizations, the City could include individual artists in the project grants program. Most artists have little or no access to grant funding and, based on the experience of similar programs in other communities, even modest project grants to

artists can generate substantial community impact. The selection process can be administered alongside the organizational grants, for greater efficiency.

Create or support an organizational strengthening program for nonprofit arts, heritage and culture organizations.

This program is proposed to be managed by the Economic Development Department using consulting services as needed. Its purpose is to strengthen Livermore's arts and culture organizations and better enable them to fulfill their missions of serving the community. Individual organizational need will vary among grantees, so the program should be highly customized to each participant, with latitude to choose and direct their own participation. Strengthening occurs best when organizations choose to undertake it and when it is based on a thorough understanding of actual organizational needs and priorities. An organizational assessment allows arts groups to analyze their own specific circumstances and needs and set their own goals. Assessment could be followed by a process of defining strategic priorities and actions, and implementation funding, if needed. This program structure implies an integrated technical assistance component, including such services as consulting, training, networking, other learning opportunities and a mini-grants program to meet immediate or threshold strengthening needs.

Facilitate access to Capital Grants Programs for nonprofit arts and culture organizations

The City, through its Cultural Arts Program, could allocate funds annually to make matching funds to arts and culture organizations for capital projects, and/or assist City heritage and/or arts and culture project development. Eligible projects could include building project planning, design, purchase, construction, expansion, renovation, tenant improvements, major equipment purchase, cash reserve or endowment. Since capital projects will probably not arise from the community in a consistent manner, unspent funds could be carried over to the following year. To better assure accountability and to promote organizational capacity strengthening, applicants could be subject to a rigorous selection process. They could at a minimum demonstrate the need for the project, its feasibility, and the sustainability of the organization during and after the project. The match requirement could be between one-to-one and four-to-one, with larger projects demanding a higher match.

Summary of Recommendations for Strand Two: Visibility and Vitality

1. **Provide operating and project grants for organizations and individual artists.**
2. **Create or support an organizational strengthening program for nonprofit arts and culture organizations.**
3. **Facilitate access to capital grants programs for nonprofit arts and culture organizations.**

Strand 3: Leverage the innate ability of arts engagement to create a sense of community and life-long learning by supporting **a diverse range of publicly accessible opportunities** for all residents, businesses and visitors to participate, with a special focus on youth.

Context

One goal of the Commission for the Arts and this plan is to increase participation from all Livermore residents, visitors and business in the arts and culture in the City, and to provide access to a full array of cultural arts experiences. For the Commissioners, this is founded on the belief that arts and culture enrich the community and that Livermore is home to a wealth of cultures, people, organizations and experiences. Deepening and expanding cultural participation among all segments of the community builds on a local tradition of cultural identity. It also provides many community benefits, such as adding value to the lives of individual residents, enhancing education, promoting economic development, supporting downtown revitalization, and reinforcing Livermore's unique identity.

Community input gathered during the planning process clarified this goal and emphasized several key aspects of participation, including strong consensus to:

- Offer more cultural programs and opportunities for youth and young adults.
- Provide arts and cultural education with: the schools, Livermore Area Recreation & Park District, and Las Positas Community College. Fortunately, during 2006, the Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District developed a strategic plan to implement the State of California's Visual and Performing Arts Curriculum Standards, which in many other communities has been the key element in reintroducing arts education to the classroom in a comprehensive manner.
- Focus on culture, not just "the arts." This means that the plan should recognize and develop Livermore's established way of life, such as its Western heritage, wine industry, science and technology, and the natural environment.
- Make arts and culture more publicly accessible, "taking the arts where the people are" and "making it part of everyday life."
- Increase public awareness of the role and value of Livermore's arts and culture throughout the community.
- Coordinate and market Livermore's arts and culture, to make the community more aware of existing activities and opportunities.

"The issue is not more cultural activities but better coordination and marketing."

Partnerships and cooperation emerged as strong themes during the planning process. Livermore has a surprising number of cultural arts organizations, artists and arts-related

activities for a community of its size, and many community members observed that Livermore should focus on promoting and strengthening its existing arts and cultural community [see Strand 2, page 14).

Partnerships are part of a long tradition of Livermore's successful festivals, many of which include arts and culture. The annual ArtWalk, and Wine Country Festival in downtown Livermore as well as the Livermore Rodeo draw substantial numbers of residents and visitors, and are integrated into Livermore's identity. These events are not only a distinguishing feature of the community; they are also examples of how Livermore can move towards making arts and culture publicly accessible to a broad range of citizens.

Partnerships are also an effective means of leveraging modest resources of existing organizations, and a natural fit with Livermore's location within the Tri-Valley Region. Cooperation has become normal for other sectors of the community, including the Fire Department and the Convention and Visitors Bureau. The cultural arts staff of several nearby cities already meets on a quarterly basis and is producing a regional event calendar, Take 5 and Dublin, Pleasanton and Livermore are working on a temporary art exhibit, Art Takes Place building on the rich tradition of cooperation. These continue to be valuable tactics to consider as the cultural development of Livermore is enhanced.

Recommendations

- Convene youth service providers and organizers throughout the City to evaluate and create opportunities for youth access to the arts and arts learning in and outside of school settings, in families, and in the juvenile justice system**

The City has an array of opportunities to build dynamic, sustainable arts programs for young people and to reach them in all the public spaces set up to support their learning and community engagement. The Commission for the Arts is uniquely positioned to convene and facilitate potential partners to streamline existing services; leverage opportunities for reaching significant numbers of youth; create strategies for guiding artists and cultural arts organizations to providing services to young people most in need of them; and combining financial resources to reduce administrative duplication and maximize outreach. A significant outcome would be determination of high impact, low cost partnerships that would draw attention to the value of the arts in connecting every child and youth to a community of caring adults.

- Facilitate expansion and/or creation of a downtown arts and culture festival, building upon existing opportunities and seeking partnerships for new arts engagements**

The City could help produce an annual festival dedicated to arts and culture primarily in the Cultural Arts District, emphasizing local cultural assets and existing activities in downtown. This festival would make arts and culture more publicly accessible and help to promote and strengthen Livermore's cultural arts organizations and artists. Festival programming should utilize as many places and assets in the District as

"Many visual artists and musicians work at the Lab – perhaps there should be a festival of arts produced by employees at the Lab."

possible, with activities outside the District if they are intrinsic to the programming and do not detract from the downtown focus. The annual ArtWalk is an example of an existing, upscale one day event that could be expanded into a larger festival.

Programming over time could include visual, performing and literary arts, as well as the range of Livermore's cultural assets, such as its heritage organizations, the laboratories, the rodeo and wine-making. To fit the needs of the audience, festival programming can be supplemented by the selective addition of outside attractions. The festival can also reinforce Livermore's cultural identity by adopting cultural themes consistent with the community's character, such as science and technology, agriculture and Western heritage. The festival could be managed as part of the management structure developed in Strand One (page 10).

Festivals can become self-sustaining--the City could provide seed funding during the initial years of the festival until it can establish itself and its financial sustainability can be assessed to determine future City funding needs. The City can also be a vital partner in the management of the festival by providing necessary municipal services, such as security, traffic management, and clean up.

Encourage cultural events and opportunities for youth and young adults, including seeking mechanisms for mini-grants to cultural arts organizations, artists and their public and private partners

As part of its commitment to serve young people, the City could adopt policies that encourage private individuals, businesses and nonprofits to provide cultural events and opportunities for young adults, consistent with the goals and identity of the Cultural Arts District. While in existence, the Railroad Avenue Unity Skate Shop's support for local musicians and bands, and their periodic concerts at the store was an exemplary symbiotic relationship. Such gathering places are essential and strengthen the positive aspects of youth culture.

Awareness and accommodating attitude among city officials of the value of such events for young adults will go a long way towards establishing the kind of cultural and artistic diversity essential to the success of the Cultural Arts District. Local producers, events and artists from Livermore's young adult community may be ineligible for grants through the Cultural Arts Program, since they will often not be nonprofit organizations. They could also be included in festival programming, the communitywide marketing program, networking events, District planning, and other aspects of building the local cultural community. Also, an accommodating attitude from established cultural arts groups and on the part of police and other city employees will help to integrate this younger element of the community into its cultural ecology.

Mini-grants for youth events throughout Livermore would help meet the need for arts and cultural services for youth. Small grants of \$500 to \$2,500 will help local groups to offer non-commercial events such as battle-of-the-bands, teen art competitions, poetry slams, student film competitions and other youth-oriented programs. To facilitate access by smaller community organizations and groups, funding could be available through a streamlined application process and throughout the year. The City can also serve as a partner in the production of these events, by facilitating permitting and other event logistics. A model program can be seen in Theatre Bay Area's *Creative Assistance for the Small (organization) and Hungry (artist) (CA\$H)* granting program in San Francisco.

Implement the public art program and develop a public art master plan, building on the current program vision of the Commission for the Arts

The City has initiated a public art program using the funds generated from the parking garage project (1% of the cost of newly-constructed public buildings). To date, one art project has been completed, the Wine Country Tile Mural, and Art Takes Place, a regional public art project, is underway. The program was based on the Interim Public Art Policy. The Commission recommends that this policy be approved as the Public Art Policy (see Appendix p. 50).

"The public art program needs to commission more challenging work."

The consultant team reviewed the Public Art Policy. It is a well-designed program that has emulated the best practices in the public art field. The consultants also reviewed the proposed public art ordinance and make the following recommendations:

- The City might encourage direct contributions by developers to the Public Art Fund, giving the City much more flexibility in developing the Public Art program.
- It is recommended that the primary method of selecting artists should be on the basis of the artist's professional qualifications and body of completed artworks, and not on the basis of a proposal. In other words, the City would be selecting artists, not artworks. The important reason for this distinction is that the artist should spend time in Livermore and engage the community before the artwork design is developed. This will ensure that the artwork is relevant to Livermore – its values and aspirations, its history and culture and its physical environment.

There are several further steps the City can take to enhance its public art program. The Commission for the Arts could work with the City to develop a public art master plan that will give direction and future vision to the program. The master plan would include guidelines, policies and procedures for the commissioning and installation of public art projects throughout the city, with an emphasis on appropriate citizen participation to build community ownership of the program and to help it reflect local sensibilities. In addition, it would develop a series of public art contracts for commissioned art, design team art, purchased art, temporary art and art on loan. At the same time, the City could develop a policy on gifts and donations of public art and procedures for the maintenance of the public art collection over time.

The Commission has already begun to develop a vision for its public art program that the public art master plan can build upon. They are envisioning a series of murals in the downtown area, the first plaque for a Word Walk (a series of quotes on plaques in the downtown area), and statuary.

Create arts and education partnerships with Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District (LVJUSD), Livermore Area Recreation and Park District (LARPD) and Las Positas Community College

City partnerships with Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District (LVJUSD), the Livermore Area Recreation and Park District (LARPD) and Las Positas Community College would support the implementation of both the District's Visual and Performing Arts plan and the LARPD programming master plan and to facilitate access by the

schools and the park district to the community's arts and culture assets. Such partnerships could be administered jointly by the Cultural Arts Program, the school district's Superintendent's office, the Executive Director of the Park District, and leadership at LPCC. Each entity would appoint a staff liaison to coordinate communications and identify opportunities within their districts.

These entities have expressed the desire to provide opportunities for students and residents for learning, performing, exhibiting, recreation and working in Livermore's arts and culture community. Arts and culture organizations have expressed an interest to partner with schools and the park district's programming and buildings to provide educational and outreach programs. Historical state funding for arts learning and for after-school programs may also create and expand accessible quality arts programs for pre-K to college age youth, with few (but concentrated) additional City resources.

Through coordination in the Cultural Arts Program, The City should develop a directory, available in print and on-line, of local arts and culture educational resources. A successful model for the directory can be seen in San Francisco's *Inside/Out: a Guide to Arts and Arts Education Resources for Children and Teens in San Francisco*. The Livermore directory should include:

- educational programs to be provided in schools and after school;
- programs provided by organizations and individual arts educators;
- work and internship opportunities in the community;
- contact and other information about each school;
- And outside opportunities, funding, research, advocacy, networking and other resources for arts education.

The City's coordinating services could also serve as an information and referral center, with staff actively seeking to identify and facilitate exchanges and opportunities for the schools and for local arts and culture organizations and people. The districts' staff should compile a list and a network of arts education contacts among all schools and within the park district, and maintain regular meetings and communications to keep the network informed and active. All partners' staff should take parallel responsibilities to stay aware of arts education resources, interests and developments, and to identify and facilitate exchanges and opportunities to connect outside resources with the schools and park district.

Develop a community-wide arts and culture marketing program (supports Strand 2)

A communitywide arts and culture marketing program, administered by the infrastructure and management mechanism created to support the Cultural Arts District recommended in Strand 1 (page 10) would build audiences for Livermore's arts and culture programs, enhance access to arts engagement for all in Livermore, and increase community awareness of local arts and culture. The program could include a master calendar, event marketing, a robust website, printed materials, a publication, direct mail, advertising, promotion packages, discounted tickets, cross-promotions, banners, a word-of-mouth campaign, and other non-traditional methods.

"Cross promotion in marketing is possible only if there is a uniform message that everyone buys into – there is no common language used by the City, the chamber and the winegrowers."

The marketing program could collaborate with the Tri-Valley Convention and Visitors Bureau (CVB). As a part of its master calendar, the cultural service organization could conduct monthly meetings of key stakeholders, which can also function as a local coordinating and networking group. These meetings could include Cultural Arts staff, cultural arts staff from nearby cities, local arts and culture organizations, young adult event producers, Downtown Livermore, the Tri-Valley CVB, the Livermore Library, Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District (LVJUSD), the Livermore Area Recreation and Park District (LARPD), Las Positas Community College, Tri-Valley Artists Guild (TVAG), the Livermore Cultural arts Council (LCAC), Livermore Art Association, Livermore Winegrowers' Association, and other interested cultural stakeholders. A successful model of a communitywide arts marketing program is *Arts polis*, in San Jose, which would be a useful reference point for developing Livermore's program.

Summary of Recommendations for Strand 3: Diverse range of publicly accessible opportunities

- 1. Convene youth service providers throughout the City to evaluate and create opportunities for youth access to arts engagement.**
- 2. Adopt policies that encourage private individuals, businesses and nonprofits to provide cultural events and opportunities for young adults, consistent with the goals and identity of the Cultural Arts District.**
- 3. Provide mini-grants for youth events throughout Livermore, to help meet the need for arts and cultural services for youth.**
- 4. Implement the public art program including a public art master plan whereby building on the current program vision of the Commission for the Arts.**
- 5. Develop an arts education partnership with the Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District, Livermore Arts Recreation and Park District and Las Positas Community College.**
- 6. Develop a communitywide arts and culture marketing program, administered by the infrastructure mechanism created to support the Cultural Arts District.**

Strand 4: Provide long-term, sustainable resources that enable the City to support the arts, heritage and culture communities as a resource for all residents, visitors and businesses

Context

Livermore has recently begun to use arts and culture as part of its long-term economic development strategy and has yet to devote substantial resources to that end.

Currently, the City provides staff support for the Commission for the Arts and has made modest funding available to commission public art. At the same time, the City has made a major commitment to support the capital costs of constructing the 500-seat theater and the acquisition of the SBC building as one of the properties on the site for the proposed 1,800-seat theater. It has devoted the solid waste mitigation fees to the performing arts center as well.

In addition, private support for arts and culture in Livermore is very limited, with the result that virtually every local nonprofit cultural organization operates with a tiny budget and no paid professional staff.

As part of the research for this plan, the consultants conducted a study of a cohort of 11 cities with characteristics similar to Livermore. On average these cities currently devote \$4.16 per citizen per year to support arts and cultural activities. Over the last three years, the City of Livermore has committed funds to the theater projects and other cultural arts activities. This equates to between \$11 and \$12 per citizen for the art related activities. We recommend that the City continues to promote this level of funding.

"There is a need for a City-sponsored community theater company."

Recommendations

Ensuring sufficient and sustainable support for Livermore's arts and culture will require development of a variety of public and private resources. Livermore is relatively financially healthy when compared with other California cities. At the same time, the City wishes to limit the growth of new demands on the City's General Fund. In this context, the consultants recommend that the City identify a new, dedicated revenue stream to support arts and cultural development. This could come in the form of a private development fee for the arts.

Adopt a Private Development Fee for the Arts

The extension of the percent for art requirement to new residential, commercial and industrial development in Livermore is a logical source of support. Historically, the development market ebbs and flows with the overall economy. It is important to structure this fee with reference to the health of the local real estate market. Declines in the market suggest that too high a fee, when added to other pre-existing development fees, might discourage some projects from proceeding in Livermore. Conversely, a strong market would create the potential for capturing greater community benefit from private development. Funding from this source would permit a substantial expansion of arts and cultural programming in Livermore.

Increase the City's cultural arts staff, as funding is available

As the City explores the options for managing and implementing many of the strategies in this plan, it should also review the need for some dedicated City staff needed to fulfill the community's goals for cultural development. Successful implementation of the plan, with the benefits to quality of life, economic development, strengthening diversity, and improved educational outcomes, would be limited by the lack of sufficient staff resources. The current one quarter time assigned staff within the Economic Development Department, and the department director's oversight support, would need to be supplemented by additional dedicated staff as the plan's implementation proceeds and succeeds. Building upon partnerships and leveraging existing activities will provide a good beginning; dedicated staffing needs over time could grow to include one full time Cultural Arts manager and support staff to handle increased activities in granting, event management, and partnership facilitation. As funding becomes available, City staffing should be considered a priority within 2-3 years.

City support can also be significantly enhanced through the provision of in-kind services to support activities like festivals and special events. Such services include street closures, police protection services, health and sanitation support and site clean-up. To encourage the private sector to create new events, the City would commit to remove as many barriers as possible.

Private Funding: United Arts Fund, Workplace, and Individual Giving

While essential to success, City funding and support represents a portion of the picture. Private sector contributions will be critical to the sustainability and replicability of any programs seeded by the City. Two private sector funding developments are recommended.

The first is a united arts fund, traditionally targeted to raise money from private businesses and corporations. In a manner by which, annually, during a 4 – 6 week period, local cultural organizations work together to enlist support from local private business sources. The pooled funds get divided among the participating organizations, generally in proportion to their budget size. This model is particularly suited to a community like Livermore where the nonprofit cultural organizations are based on volunteers, rather than professional staff.

The second private sector funding effort could be the creation of a workplace giving program. In many communities this is a vital source of giving by private individuals. They work like the United Way. Each year presentations are made to businesses and corporations urging that they encourage their employees to make a small weekly or monthly contribution to the arts through payroll deductions. In some cases, the businesses match the contributions made by their employees.

Both of these private sector fund-raising efforts would be administered by the management infrastructure proposed in Strand 1 as part of the Cultural Arts District strategy (page 11). To highlight private contributions, annual arts awards and programs for leadership and volunteer development and training could also be developed.

Create a Permanent Endowment for the Arts

The one drawback to relying on a private development fee is that it will diminish over the next decade as the City is fully built out and fewer private developments take place. The consultants recommend that, if the development fee generates extra funds, a portion of the money be set aside in a permanent endowment to provide a long-term source of City funding for the arts. An endowment established with annual City contributions could also serve as an impetus for private fundraising to augment the fund, as well as a repository for special, one-time allocations of funds, such as from the sale of other City assets.

Summary of Recommendations for Strand 4: Long-Term Sustainable Resources

- 1. As funding becomes available, consider expansion of the City's cultural arts staff.**
- 2. Support the development of a united arts fund in Livermore to promote increased arts and cultural funding by private businesses and corporations.**
- 3. Support the development of a workplace giving program and promote increased arts and cultural funding by private individuals.**
- 4. Develop a permanent endowment fund for the arts through an annual set-aside of revenues from the private development fee, if the fee is increased to the point that extra funds are available.**

III. IMPLEMENTATION

Implementation of this plan is intended to take place over the next ten years. The strategies and many of the recommendations will either require ongoing action or take several years to accomplish as funding is available. Implementation is a joint responsibility of the City and a number of partner agencies. While the City will play a major role, this plan is a “community cultural plan,” meaning that is derived from the entire community and should be implemented in partnership with organizations and people from the community.

As the plan has many components, it is recommended that annually the Commission reviews funding and develops a work plan using artsALIVE! as the base. The Commission would return to Council with their annual recommendations.

Two-Year Action Plan

The Commission for the Arts is recommending the following Two-Year (07-09) Implementation Action Plan as follows:

- Amend the Municipal Code Section 2.43.020 related to the Commission for the Arts Duties and Responsibilities to include:
 - Initiate, review, approve, and install public art where appropriate.
 - Review and approve public art associated with public and private developments (The Commission for the Arts will work cooperatively with the Design Review Committee and the Planning Commission to accomplish this task).
 - Explore the need for an agreement between the City and non-profit organizations to provide cultural arts program administrative services.
 - Explore and develop cultural arts programs and facilitate communication between various youth and diversity programs to secure input, identify needs, site availability and generate events.
 - Coordinating an arts volunteer program for training and mentoring of marketing services.
- Approve a resolution accepting the Cultural Arts Master Plan and finalize the Public Art Policy.
- Adopt an ordinance for a 0.5% cultural arts fee for private residential, commercial, and industrial development. The fee will be based on the estimated construction value of each project. The fee could be satisfied by providing public art as part of the project or paying an in-lieu fee of an equal amount or some combination thereof.
- Amend the existing Public Art Fee Ordinance to allow the Commission for the Arts to approve the acquisition and installation of public art funded by the 1% public art enrichment allocation associated with the construction of publicly owned structures. The existing ordinance requires the City Council to approve the acquisition and installation of public art.

- Amend the existing Public Art Fee Ordinance to allow for expenditures of such funds on cultural programming and cultural arts organizational strengthening.
- Approve a resolution establishing a Downtown Arts and Cultural District (see attached map for boundaries).
- Begin development of a workplace-giving program for cultural arts activities and programs. The intent of the new revenue program will be to strengthen existing local cultural arts organizations and to provide monetary grants to individual artists and arts organizations for the enrichment of the arts in Livermore.
- When funds are available, consider contracting with local cultural arts organizations to oversee the coordination of strengthening and expanding local cultural arts organizations and to administer and monitor the grant program.

Primary Implementing Agencies

Under the recommendations of this plan, three agencies will be responsible for a substantial portion of implementation: 1) the cultural arts staff of the City of Livermore's Economic Development Department, 2) an infrastructure and management mechanism, and 3) the Livermore Commission for the Arts. There will be many other implementing partners; however, it is valuable to provide overall descriptions of each primary agency to clarify their responsibilities, staffing and initiation.

It is important to note that implementation of a cultural plan over a ten-year period requires great flexibility to adapt to changed circumstances. Implementing agencies should define their own appropriate roles as they develop, according to the community's needs. Accordingly, there are options presented for level of activity and the "division of labor" among implementing agencies.

Cultural Arts Staff

City responsibility for arts and culture has been handled by staff of the Economic Development Department, along with its Commission for the Arts. The Commission was created in 2005 and, together with staff, oversaw the development of this plan. The Department currently has 40% of a full-time professional staff position for cultural arts, plus part-time support staff. Under the recommendations, an arts administrator position would be created as funding becomes available and City activities require. Staff may eventually increase from a half-time .5 position to one-and-a-half (1.5) full-time arts administrator positions, plus support staff.

The cultural arts staff could be responsible for a variety of activities including:

- The Commission for the Arts
- Public art programs
- Heritage programs

- Contracts for services to the new cultural arts service organization
- Facilities development projects (along with City staff in other divisions and departments)
- Maintaining relationships with Livermore's arts and cultural community and arts agencies in neighboring communities
- Organizational strengthening, including grants and technical assistance
- Capital grants for facility improvements
- Other projects

Cultural Arts Oversight and Management Structures

This plan recognizes the need for oversight and management to fill a number of functions not currently handled by other agencies in the community and to provide arts and cultural expertise in developing programming for a successful Cultural Arts District. Several strategies should be researched and evaluated for providing this key service, including facilitation of a partnership of existing organizations, the institution of a new management team or organization, and other possibilities that may develop as the District grows.

The new functions can begin within the Economic Development Department but could be spun off within one year into contracts for services with partners, an independent nonprofit, or other outside relationship that will develop its own revenues following initial seed support from the City within two to three years. City contracts for these essential services will provide part of the revenue to support oversight and management to ensure accountability and quality.

The management structure could be responsible for all or parts of many pieces of this plan:

- Development and management of the Cultural Arts District
- As part of the Cultural Arts District, administering an artist-in-residence program; programming the downtown plazas, artist spaces and galleries; and coordinating street artists
- Development and management of a united arts fund
- Development and management of a workplace giving program
- Development and management of a community-wide arts marketing program
- Coordination of expanding an existing art festival or developing a new one

- Coordination of community education, working with the LVJUSD, the LARPD, and Las Positas Community College
- Development and management of a communitywide volunteer program

These responsibilities will be phased in over several years, although the services of a professional arts administrator and support staff will be essential to successful implementation of almost an aspect of the plan. Eventually, it is anticipated that any oversight structure will require one-and-a-half (1.5) full-time professional arts administrators, plus support staff.

Commission for the Arts

The Commission for the Arts was created in part to develop this plan. Oversight responsibility for implementation of the plan can best be accomplished through creation of an ArtsAlive! Committee reporting to the Commission that includes Commissioners and community leaders from outside the commission, to help ensure the community connections and resources needed for effective and responsive implementation. The ArtsALIVE! Committee can meet quarterly (and as-needed) to monitor progress towards implementation, solve problems and make mid-course corrections. The ArtsALIVE! Committee can also provide transparency, accountability and community responsiveness during the process of implementation.

As an advisory body to City Council, the Commission has an important role in advocacy. This role extends also to advocacy in community about ArtsALIVE! and cultural issues for Livermore generally. Finally, the Commission was constructed as a leadership body and could continue its focus on identifying and serving the cultural interests of the community. The Commission is currently viewed as having substantial integrity; it should make a priority of maintaining this position.

IV. PLANNING CONTEXT

Profile of the City of Livermore

Livermore has a well-established and distinctive cultural identity. The City is home to an unusually large and diverse collection of cultural arts organizations and other cultural assets, including a symphony, opera, dance company, theater festival, chamber music series, performing arts center, poet laureate, organizations for visual arts, literary art, film, vocal music and heritage, TV 30, and many individual artists, arts educators and artisans. In addition, the community identifies with its Western heritage and its long history of wine making, as well as the presence since the 1950's of the prestigious Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory and Sandia National Laboratory, two of the world's foremost scientific research facilities with more than 10,000 employees. Taken together, this combination of arts, culture, heritage, viticulture and science form a rich identity and way of life that is clearly acknowledged and celebrated by the community.

In July 2006, Livermore was ranked by Money Magazine as the second-best small California city to live in, and the 31st best in the US. The study looked at 745 mid-sized cities in the nation, and took into account education scores, crime rates, housing costs, employment rates, average income, cultural and recreational opportunities and other factors.

Just forty-five miles east of San Francisco, Livermore is conveniently accessible to metropolitan employment and entertainment, recreational waterways, the mountains and the ocean. Local outdoor activities are abundant along with special events, such as golf tournaments, air shows, rodeos, winery events, concerts and more.

"We're not a small town anymore."

Framed by award-winning wineries, farmlands and ranches that mirror the valley's history, the City of Livermore encompasses twenty-two square miles. Protection of the coastal range gives Livermore Valley a balmy climate that enhances the pursuit of a more relaxed lifestyle in a relatively un-congested exurban area.

Livermore has become a thriving city with a current population of approximately 80,723. The city has managed to retain its country living ambience in harmony with meeting the needs of a progressive community.

The 2005 US Census update shows significant differences between the demographics for Livermore and for the State of California. Livermore is a relatively homogeneous community. About 80% of the population is white compared with 49% for the state. Livermore's median age of 36.3 is higher than the state's average of 33.3 with a markedly higher percentage of people between the ages of 35 and 54 than the rest of the state. Families make up a large proportion of the City's population with a larger percentage of the population in family households. As of 2005, Livermore's median household income was \$92,989 compared with the state's median of \$53,629. Thirty-two percent of Livermore's population have completed a bachelor's degree or higher compared with 27% for the state. These figures give the picture of a community which is on average better educated and more financially comfortable than the rest of the state.

The number of retirement aged people in Livermore is lower than the California average; however, the percentage of people aged 65 and over increased during the 1990s. The Census also shows a smaller percentage of people between the ages of 18 and 34 in Livermore. The problem of finding reasonably priced housing for both age ranges may be a factor in the differences. In 2005, the median price of a home was approximately \$580,000 compared with \$524,000 statewide.

The well-planned development of business parks and affordable quality housing, a good public school system and community college are attracting a growing number of new residents and businesses to Livermore. Major retailers and corporations have brought economic diversity into the community along with new job opportunities.

In addition, the tourist trade has grown in the Tri-Valley with an increase in the number of local hotels and the prominence of local wineries. Downtown redevelopment is underway with the goal of preserving the city's historic charm while promoting tourism and cultural arts.

The Livermore arts community is undergoing change. The arts have been identified as a catalyst activity for redevelopment (Downtown Specific Plan, 2004) and marketing. High rents have caused artists to abandon their long-time work space and many nonprofit arts and culture organizations report having facility challenges. The Council is committed to the arts, as such, they have partnered with a non-profit to build a community 500-seat theater.

"What's special about Livermore? It's a friendly town with a very diverse population."

Economic trends demonstrate that local economies depend greatly upon the creative and intellectual capital of their citizenry. To cultivate this capital, the City needs to nurture a cultural climate that will attract a creative and diverse workforce and to ensure that all residents have access to participate in arts and cultural activities. To this end, the Livermore City Council has made arts and culture a priority. In their *Goals and Objectives for 2004-2006*, the Council has made a commitment to make Livermore a destination for cultural arts activities.

Relevant Plans and Studies

The consultants reviewed plans and studies relevant to the development of a cultural arts master plan, at the start of the community research process.

- Downtown Specific Plan (2004)
- Plan for a Livermore Commission for the Arts (2004)
- Marketing Communications and Partnership Strategy (2003)
- The National Citizen Survey's Report on the City of Livermore (2006)

The following summaries contain the most salient portions of those documents, and help set the context for the other community research conducted for this plan.

Downtown Specific Plan, Adopted February 9, 2004

This plan establishes a comprehensive vision for the revitalization of Livermore's historic downtown, in light of the City's economic development and cultural development goals. Many citizens participated in the creation of this new vision, culminating with a recommendation to create a Downtown Arts and Culture District. The consultants for this study concur with that recommendation as a major point of departure in re-envisioning downtown Livermore.

Vision

- "...the District will be immediately recognizable as the City's center."
- "...arriving at the intersection of Livermore and First, a grand civic plaza marks a central gathering place and 'public living room' for the city. Near a central kiosk in the plaza advertising upcoming cultural events..."
- "...the plaza serves as the setting for city-wide celebrations..."

Community Process

- The participants voiced consensus for the alternative recommending a Downtown Arts and Culture District with a defined retail core straddling Livermore Avenue.

Existing Conditions

- Historically, Downtown has been the center of the City of Livermore. It was the center of both business and culture.
- All of the traditional elements – home, work, and marketplace – have become more diffuse as the Downtown lost its role as the "center of things."
- While Downtown stills serves as a location for commercial establishments, its viability as a retail center has suffered in its competition with the larger freeway stores.
- The most memorable aspect of Downtown is its concentration of restaurants on First Street.
- There are no civic buildings located Downtown, and there are few parks or open spaces within which to take refuge from the constant stream of cars and trucks.
- Downtown is the setting for major community events, festivals and parades, which draw a large number of people from the town and the region.
- Even with few reasons to come Downtown, people still come. They come to dine at its restaurants, enjoy its festivals, and to stroll along the streets.

Revitalization Objectives

Downtown should be the center of all Livermore, a place that shows off the best of the city. Amenities and options are found here that are unavailable elsewhere: access to unique shops and destinations; connections to public transportation facilities; and public and cultural facilities, like parks, theaters and museums.

The primary goal of the Livermore Downtown Specific Plan is to revitalize the most public district in the City. The following objectives are the path to this goal:

- Provide a cohesive, comprehensive strategy that addresses each of the Downtown's roles as the center of the city: as Livermore's most unique shopping district, as its civic meeting place, and as a neighborhood hub for the residential enclaves that surround it.
- Bring to the surface the distinctive visual character of Livermore, by drawing from the best of what is already there: Downtown's historic fabric, its yellow-bricked buildings and ornate detailing, and some of the surrounding wine country.
- Reflect the unique qualities of the Livermore community: its social history, its architectural heritage, its agricultural past, the scientific and artistic influences of today, and the individuality of the populations who call it home today.
- Make Downtown a part of the regional economy and an economic success to ensure its continued viability with market attractions that meet the needs of the area, and are a draw for the community and beyond.

The Strategy for Downtown

- Promote the concentration of activity-generating uses in a compact cluster in the center of Downtown.
 - Work with business organizations to market Downtown as "the place to be" with a diversity of retail, restaurants, shopping, entertainment and cultural activities.
- Maximize investment in new housing construction throughout the Specific Plan Area.
- Dramatically transform the character of the Downtown's primary pedestrian space, First Street, along its length between M Street and Maple.
 - Make the sidewalks of First Street a wonderful environment for pedestrian activity of all kinds, with more shade trees and seating, pocket plazas to stop, rest and gather; outdoor areas for eating; and public places for art and special events.
- Focus immediate attention on opportunity sites capable of delivering dramatic short-term beneficial change.
 - Catalyst Project #1: Livermore Valley Center (LVC) – a conference and cultural complex including retail, office and a local theater.

- Catalyst Project #2: The Livermore Village – A mixed use project including a regional destination design center and a vibrant housing development, including art components such as live-work units and an artist workshop/center.
- Catalyst Project #3: Groth Brothers Site – an anchor node that includes restaurants, entertainment (live music, comedy clubs, etc), retail or second-story office space.
- Promote the development of an arts and culture component, to make Livermore's Downtown a "Center for the Arts."
 - Designate Downtown as Livermore's Arts District and establish programs such as an Artist-in-Residence Program; community arts events such as an annual Arts Festival, gallery nights, lecture series, or brown bag concerts; and curriculum-based arts education in the schools, or art programs for at-risk youth or people with disabilities.
 - "Kick start" the Arts District with artist live-work-sell lofts. Provide space immediately adjacent to the Downtown Core where artists can live and work and sell their work from ground floor workshop spaces.
 - Assist in the development of an artist's workshop facility, in order to provide a gathering place for the local arts community that is capable of evolving into a center for the Tri-Valley area.
 - Encourage the re-use of existing structures to provide additional space for artist living, working, and selling Downtown, as the Arts District grows and expands.
- Identify, target, and recruit uses with a wide regional appeal that are under-supplied in the Tri-Valley.
 - Design Center
 - Supporting businesses, related to design and the arts that can create synergies with the presence of the Design Center. Encourage businesses that are supportive of local art culture, such as galleries and decorators, and independent retailers. (This should include a quality art supply store and a good local bookstore.)
- Place a high priority on the design, financing and construction of a new Performing Arts Center in the heart of Downtown.
 - Reserve sufficient land for this facility...
 - Design the structure to be a civic landmark...
- Revive the role of the First Street and Livermore Avenue intersection as the heart of the City.
- Build on the high quality stock of historic structures to set the tone for design in the District.

- Leverage the high amenity value of the Carnegie Block to promote investment in the residential neighborhood south of the Downtown Core.
- Enhance the convenience of Downtown parking and access.
- Take every opportunity to concentrate civic (and quasi-civic) buildings in the Downtown.
 - Locate facilities such as cooperative facilities for the production of arts, or cultural venues such as cinemas, theaters and performing arts centers in Downtown.
 - Support the development of a Downtown hotel.
- Take every opportunity to revive Downtown's role as a primary job center.
- Maximize transit opportunities for commuters to conveniently travel to Downtown Livermore.

Urban Design Framework

The Livermore Art Association, the Livermore-Amador Symphony, the Livermore Choral Society, the Livermore Valley Opera, the Livermore Cultural Arts Council, and the Livermore Commission for the Arts are current forces within the city, promoting education and cultural activities. However, they are dispersed throughout the city and many of them do not have a permanent base. Performances are held at various locations, from high schools to churches and wineries. This dispersion means that the arts community has no identifiable center. There is no single place the community come together over arts and culture.

The arts need to be more accessible to all of Livermore's residents, in order to enable greater participation in cultural activities and greater interest in productions. They need to be woven throughout Downtown, in its streets and outdoor spaces as well as in its stores and galleries so that art and culture center the daily interactions of the community.

Providing Livermore's cultural organizations with low-cost facilities in Downtown, such as meeting rooms, office space, rehearsal studios, workshops, and small performance and exhibitions spaces, will give them a home base.

Support for the arts will include putting their works along an ArtWalk that weaves through the Downtown. Artists will be encouraged to explore other venues on their own, so that a visitor will be able to come upon art in unexpected, ad-hoc places: on ledges, in vacant storefronts, around corners and embedded in the sidewalk.

Development Standards

Permitted Uses

- Quality goods and services, including small crafts and arts, special furniture, etc.
- Personal services, including photographer.

- Performing arts, civic and cultural facilities, including libraries, public recreation facilities, museums, art galleries, movie theaters and auditorium.

Conditional Uses

- Live-work: residential living spaces may include an integrated work space principally used by one or more of the residents. Residential use must be the predominant use of the unit, and commercial activity should be secondary.
- Instructional facilities for music, art, dance, etc.

Implementation

- Identify areas for facilities such as new housing, or artist residences and workshops.
- Initiate the development of the Livermore Valley Center.
- Initiate a high quality mixed-use project on the Livermore Village development, including live-work units and an artists' workshop/center.
- Assist in the creation of a vibrant entertainment facility.

Plan for a Livermore Arts Commission (Gary Schaub, May 24, 2004)

Recommendations relating to the cultural plan:

- Develop the City's public art program, by creating a stronger set of public art requirements in the city – both for public works projects and for private development.
- Develop and maintain a modest grant program to seed and enable select community arts activities and events.
- Work with City staff in seeking arts support from government funding (county, state and federal), and support efforts by local cultural arts organizations and artist in obtaining private sector support for their activities.
- Encourage a process to gather data on the economic impact of the arts on the Livermore community.
- There should be increasing staffing for the arts program – ½-time position to start – by year 3, there should be a full time professional cultural affairs manager, with clerical support and a ½ time public art coordinator – by year 5, there should be a manager, two program coordinators and appropriate administrative and clerical support.

Marketing Communications and Partnership Strategy (2003)

This study was undertaken for the purpose of creating a new branding identity for the City of Livermore. Four aspects of this new identity emerged from the planning process:

- A rich history rooted in Western Heritage
- A connection to the land through Viticulture and Open Space preservation
- An educated and forward-thinking community exemplified by Science and Technology
- A sharing of the human spirit through Arts and Culture

Cultural Assets

The study further identified several “Cultural Assets” which could partner with the City in implementing and marketing this new brand.

Cultural Asset: Livermore Cultural Arts Council (LCAC)

- Description of Asset – Formed in 1966, an association of education and cultural organizations within the City of Livermore established to promote, present, educate and increase appreciation and awareness of the arts through activities and by maintaining a calendar of local events on its Web site, with an historical tradition of cultural appreciation and local community involvement.
- Partnership Potential – Support for the development of a Livermore performing arts center, especially the community theater component, by providing smaller venue activities and events through its member organizations. The importance of the arts and sciences in Livermore underscores the continuing need to showcase examples, the importance of community space (e.g., gallery, science/art hall, multi-purpose room), and the need for collaborative exhibits and demonstrations, as well as educational space in both traditional and non-traditional settings.
- Issues or Conflicts – Limited funding, structured as unpaid volunteer organizations, and a perceived lack of coordination between various cultural organizations in the community and surrounding area (e.g., Alameda County Arts Commission, Livermore Cultural Arts Council, Livermore Valley Performing Arts Center (LVPAC) formerly Livermore Valley Conference & Cultural Center), specifically around projects of identified community value such as calendaring events.
- Partner Needs – Sufficient funding and an organization's structure to communicate more effectively with its member organizations and memberships through enhanced internal communication methods (e.g., Web site, newsletter) or links to City Communication methods.

Cultural Asset: Livermore Valley Performing Arts Center (LVPAC formerly Livermore Valley Conference & Cultural Center - LVCCC)

- Type of Asset – A non-for-profit advocacy and fundraising organization for the proposed Livermore performing arts center that is considered to be a major component of the City's Downtown Specific Plan. The organization has a sophisticated Web site and conceptual plans for two theaters as part of a performing arts center and a major element in the development of the historic downtown.
- Description of Asset – A fundraising organization that envisions a dynamic, new environment in Livermore's historic downtown, showcasing world-class science and technology, an innovative higher education complex, a wine visitors center and performing arts theaters. Partnering with the community, private investors are expected to provide a hotel and event facility, fine restaurants, shops and offices to complement the public uses.
- Partnering Potential – This organization has committed itself to raising the funding necessary to construct two performing arts theaters within the larger umbrella of the performing arts center, an 1800-seat major venue and a 500-seat community theater. The importance of the arts and sciences in Livermore underscores the continuing need to showcase examples, the importance of community space (e.g., gallery, art/science hall, multi-purpose room), and the need for collaborative exhibits and demonstrations, as well as educational space in both traditional and non-traditional settings.
- Issues or Conflicts – The City and the community are engaged in determining the feasibility of financing two theaters and related funding mechanisms to support one or both theaters following construction. At least on the surface, there does not appear to be a high level or formalized collaboration among the various cultural associations (e.g., between LCAC and other cultural organizations in the community and surrounding area, such as Alameda County Arts Commission, Livermore Commission for the Arts, Livermore Cultural Arts Council). This needs to be addressed and the strengths of organizations and individuals mobilized to address this issue. Once the economic feasibility studies in which the City is involved are completed, a facilitated, roundtable discussion needs to occur in which innovative solutions are identified and addressed through a collaborative process.
- Partner Needs – Project clarification through the land-use process and the feasibility studies now occurring needs to continue, particularly that which will aid in clarifying fundraising potential, financial needs (both initially for construction and longer-term for sustaining purposes), as well as identifying the venues through which collaboration and/or consensus-building can occur by involving all elements of the cultural community.

Comments

Various comments related to arts and culture gathered during the surveying process:

City Council (Individual Council member responses)

Question: What, if anything would you change of the “image” of Livermore?

- “Not sure I’d fundamentally change anything, emphasize what we have and expand opportunities for culture, kids, and recreation.”

Question: Why should a new resident move to Livermore?

- “Multiple alternative, individual identities, not like other “bedroom communities,” small local cultural amenities, proximate to open space, hiking, i.e., take advantage of what already exists.”

Department Heads (Individual responses)

Question: How would you profile your client or customer base (residents, businesses, within Livermore, outside Livermore, etc.)?

- “...The typical customer is interested in the development of Livermore’s economy and the services and jobs that come with the planned developments. Most customers are excited about new developments planned for the community. They want and appreciate more retail services, job opportunities and cultural arts and entertainment facilities...”

Question: What are the major challenges in reaching your targeted audiences (clients/customers)?

- “...City Council and staff support revitalizing downtown to include a mixture of housing opportunities for all income groups, new performing arts theater, movie theater, retail shops, restaurants and offices that support a thriving downtown....”

Question: What are the major opportunities in reaching your target audiences (clients/customers)?

- (Essentially the same response as above)

Question: When working with the public, what do you perceive to be the greatest challenge(s) to your department and to you personally?

- “The greatest challenge is providing the customer with current, up-to-date information, which is not on our Web site.”

Question: What one word best describes the image of Livermore?

Evolving
Community-oriented
Growing
Agricultural
Small town
Small town
Politics
Open space
Suburbia
Suburban
Vibrant
Friendly
Transitions
Cowboy
Multi-faceted
Eclectic
Rural
Suburban
Rural
The Country
Peaceful
Small town
Quaint and fun
Exciting
Caring
Community-oriented
Small town feel
Identity
Evolving
Cowboy
Dynamic

Question: What, if anything, would you change in terms of the “image” of Livermore?

- “More sophisticated, upscale community with lifestyle to match.”

Question: What are the major challenges and/or roadblocks to marketing the City of Livermore?

- “The lack of identification of the City of Livermore through a recognizable entrance....”

External Partner Organizations

Question: What are the major attractions for a new business moving to the City of Livermore?

- “A place to entertain clients with the wineries and fine arts.”

Question: What are the major attractions for a new resident moving to the City of Livermore?

- “The wineries, a new library, fine arts and big expensive houses.”

Question: What would your organization hope to gain in working together to promote the City of Livermore?

- “Livermore has a greater attendance and recognitions of cultural events.”

Question: What do you see as the role of your organization in working together to promote the City of Livermore?

- “Provide an education of cultural arts events and collaboration with local cultural organizations.”

Question: What, if anything would you change in terms of the image of the City of Livermore?

- “Play up the exciting lifestyle-related changes the city has made/is making. Downplay the rural component that seems to equate with backward and boring.”

The National Citizen Survey's Report on the City of Livermore (2006)

This study, a collaborative effort between National Research Center and the International City/County Management Association, rated citizen perceptions in the areas of quality of life, community characteristics, safety and community participation. One benchmark question related to opportunities to attend cultural activities in Livermore.

The study indicated that 44% of Livermore's citizens rated "opportunities to attend cultural activities" as one of the important characteristics of the city. But when asked to rate that characteristic for Livermore on a scale of excellent to poor, the following results were obtained:

	Excellent	Good	Fair	Poor
Cultural Opportunities	7%	32%	45%	3%

Also, when compared to comparable west coast cities, Livermore's self-rating fell into the 21st percentile, significantly below the norm.

Multi-City Comparative Study of Arts Funding

The consultants conducted a study during summer 2006 comparing aspects of arts funding among a cohort of eleven cities. The purpose of the study is to provide a frame of reference for key issues in the cultural arts master planning process, especially: 1) How much do comparable cities spend on the arts? 2) What do they spend it on? 3) What revenues do they use to fund the arts?

The cities that appear in this study were selected by Livermore staff and the consultants as comparable cities in the region:

Antioch
Dublin
Fremont
Milpitas
Modesto
Pleasanton
San Leandro
San Ramon
Tracy
Union City
Walnut Creek

Arts Spending per Capita

Average annual city spending on the arts was \$4.16 per person in the last fiscal year. By comparison, over the last three years, Livermore spent between \$11 and \$12 per person on the arts.

For this study, spending for the arts is defined as net annual arts expenditures. By this definition, per capita arts spending ranged between \$12 in Tracy and \$27.60 in Walnut Creek. (Note that Tracy is currently completing construction on a performing and visual arts center, with a budget of approximately \$19 million, and will, within a year, have annual arts expenses of approximately \$1 million, or more than \$12 per person.) It is noteworthy that this range of arts spending roughly parallels results of regional and national studies of other cohorts of cities, large and small. The populations of the cities in the cohort range roughly between 50,000 and 210,000 people. Larger populations do not directly correlate with higher local arts spending, although total city expenditures are typically higher in larger cities.

Most of the cities reported that local spending on the arts has remained steady for the past three years. One city reporting a falling arts budget cited citywide budget cuts as the cause of the problem. A few cities reported that spending on the arts has increased over the past three years. One of these cities reported that it has been able to recover more expenses through fees and received additional funds from its Arts Commission, while another city cited the construction of a new theatre as the reason for increased spending on the city's arts.

Types of Arts Spending (Arts Programs)

Spending on the arts consists of a common range of line items. Examples of what cities spend their arts budgets on include public art, galleries, theatres, educational programs, summer concerts, administration, and grants to local cultural arts organizations.

Almost all of the cities in the study have a public art program. A majority of them either have a percent-for-art program or are trying to create one. Their percent-for-art programs require new capital projects to pay fees equivalent to 1% to 1½% of the construction costs to a fund for public art.

Revenue Sources for the Arts

The majority of cities fund their arts through the General Fund; however, other funding streams include grants, sponsorships, fundraising events, and donations (plus program revenues, which were excluded from the calculation of arts spending for this study). Although all of the cities in this study have a Transient Occupancy Tax, only one city (Antioch) dedicates a portion of it towards the arts. Livermore currently funds arts through the General Fund plus a voluntary percentage of city development in the downtown area.

Governance (Arts Commissions)

All of the cities in this study have either an Arts Commission or a Parks and Recreation Commission, which oversees the city's cultural programs. The number of

commissioners per city ranges between five and nine, and seven commissioners is the most common. The cities that do not have an Arts Commission (namely, San Leandro and Union City) handle arts-related affairs through a Parks and Recreation Commission and tend to spend a much lower amount on the arts compared to cities with a separate Arts Commission. Livermore's Commission for the Arts has nine members.

Conclusions

Livermore's arts spending is currently substantially less than the average for cities in this cohort. Nonetheless, average spending should only be one factor in determining an appropriate arts spending level for future cultural development. Additional factors should be considered, such as Livermore's goals for incorporating the arts into its overall civic agenda, the potential benefits of arts investments, and the relationship of arts spending to cultural facilities.

Cities with relatively high arts spending, such as Walnut Creek and (beginning in 2007) Tracy, are communities that, like Livermore, have made a substantial public investment in cultural facilities and view arts and culture as intrinsic to their identities and community development. Therefore, arts spending is viewed as a corollary strategy to other community investment strategies, such as downtown revitalization, economic development, libraries and education. Livermore now views the arts in this manner. For example, it has identified arts and culture as one strategy for downtown redevelopment, incorporated artists' live/work spaces into the Livermore Village site, and is currently investing more than \$22 million in the downtown performing arts center (500-seat theater). Livermore can and should invest higher than average amounts in its annual arts spending to realize the returns on this investment.

V. APPENDICES

Public Art Policy

1. Introduction

The City of Livermore is beginning to develop and include public art works in its public parks, streets, and plazas, and within City owned buildings. Through artsALIVE!, Livermore's Cultural Arts Master Plan, the City endeavors to feature more works of art in public places as well as supporting art related activities that enhance and further develop the art community of Livermore. In the City's existing collection, there are two main components:

- a) Private sector contributions which provide art works as part of development or the entitlement process, for example the sculptures provided on site in the Station Square housing development statuary in Hanson Park;
- b) City collection housed in public buildings and on City grounds.

Public art plays an important role in increasing the understanding and enjoyment of art works by the community. Art is more accessible and visible to people when displayed in public areas. A key feature of public art work is the importance of integrating art into the urban fabric of the city in order to enrich and enhance the physical attractiveness of the city. Public art transforms spaces and makes a valuable contribution to our appreciation of the city and the quality of public places.

In addition, public art located in public places reflects the unique environment and cultural identity of the city to visitors and to residents of Livermore. It often provides a link with our history and can contribute to development of tourism.

2. What is Public Art?

The term "Public Art" is defined as artistic works created for, or located in part of a public space or facility and/or accessible to members of the public. Public Art includes works of a permanent or temporary nature located in the public domain.

Public Art works includes:

- Art works created for specific locations
- Temporary exhibits, exhibitions, events, performances, and/or art work installations located in a public space.
- Art works produced through involvement of the community
- Integration of art and architecture to enhance the design of urban or public spaces
- Collaboration of artists, architects or urban designers to create unique physical environments or features which integrates art into the urban fabric of the city.

Examples include sculpture, murals, glass or water features, landscaping, uniquely designed or site specific paving, furniture and parts of buildings, sound and light works, organic form, works that may decompose or melt, memorabilia or ceremonial objects related to civic activities.

A Public Space means all public spaces which the public has access to or can view; this includes, but is not limited to parks, streets, squares, promenades, architectural features, public plazas and foyers.

3. Art Policy and Guidelines

The Livermore Public Art Policy is a key strategy in the management of the City's current collection of public art works and for commissioning new art works.

The strategy aims to provide a clear policy and guidelines for the commissioning, creation, placement, maintenance and promotion of the City's Public Art. The policy guides and informs the criteria for the assessment of all public art commissioned by or proposed to the Commission for the Arts, as well as management and promotion of the existing collection. This includes the expenditure of funds collected through strategies to be described in artsALIVE!. The establishment of an inventory of public art works, to quantify the extent, the value, and condition of the current collection will be completed as a first step in the process.

4. Policy Objectives:

- Increase the awareness of public art and promote opportunities to further advance public art.
- Contribute to the unique identity of the City of Livermore within the downtown and other areas of the City where appropriate.
- Encourage the involvement of artists in the design and development of public spaces by facilitating collaboration between artists, planners, architects, landscape architects and urban designers whenever possible in the total design process.
- Develop a public art strategy that integrates art into the urban design fabric of the city in order to create high quality public spaces through the integration of art, urban design and architecture.
- Encourage artworks which are accessible to the public either visually or physically.
- Involve the community.
- Excite the imagination of the public and increase the understanding and enjoyment of public art.
- Encourage artworks which have relevance to their site, to the history of the area and be in keeping with the nature and cultural significance of the public domain.
- Enhance the economic and cultural vitality of the City.
- Ensure recognition that Livermore's art activities are valuable and a significant component of the City's culture, heritage and economic vitality. As such, the programs and policies should be professionally managed, maintained and promoted as funds are available.

5. Scope of Policy

The policy principally covers the area described in artsALIVE! as the Cultural Arts District however, policy philosophy and processes will apply throughout the city.

6. Identification of sites and opportunities

Cultural Arts District sites appropriate for locating new art works in downtown locations are described on tables 1 and 3 (located at the end of this policy description). Other opportunities for integral artistic development in new development projects and art related activities will be presented to the Commission as they these opportunities arise.

7. Selection of Artists – Commissioned Works

The policy encourages the commission of works by artists from the Tri-Valley arts community. The encouragement of Livermore residents to participate is an integral part of the policy, and will contribute to the unique identity of the City of Livermore as an outstanding city of the Tri-Valley. However, this policy does not preclude consideration given to commissioning of international artists where appropriate.

The selected artist(s) will be commissioned to carry concepts proposed through the Commission (and/or artsALIVE!) and through completion of the work. The contractual arrangements between the City of Livermore and the artist will define certain agreed parameters for the work and the process will be monitored by Staff to the Commission for the Arts, with any major changes to concept, scale and materials being negotiated prior to contract signing.

Proposals from the Commission will define:

- The audience and/or community the art work will engage
- Concept development
- The process by which the contract design will be monitored
- Responsibilities of contractual parties
- Technical requirements
- Site information (including plans)
- Budget

The artist commissioned to carry out a public work will creatively interpret the proposal given in terms of their craft, skills and vision.

The artist's proposal will be presented to the Commission prior to contracting with the artist. The Commission has the option to display a proposed work in a public location for public comment prior to contracting with the artist.

Artists considered should show a balance of involvement of local and national artists, male and female, and represent the values inherent to Livermore.

Artists considered should have the credentials and/or track record and the ability to execute works of the scale envisaged, but this must not exclude opportunities for other artists of merit.

Selection of artists for public art works may be based on the following:

- Competition - publicly advertised
- Limited Competition between invited parties
- Specific commission, acquisition or appointment

In many cases, a short list of applicants will be briefed on the project, and will be required to make initial design proposals for the site. A stipend may be given to each submitting artist for this stage of the process as funds are available.

From the submissions and this process an artist will be selected by the Commission.

8. Guidelines

Public works of art will be considered for selection if the proposal:

- Is specifically designed for its site
- Adds to the local identity and profile in the context of the City of Livermore
- Is robust and easy to maintain
- Aesthetically enhances the public space or built environment to which it relates or otherwise interacts with its surrounding environment
- Is suitable by way of form and quality for public viewing and accessibility
- Is a suitable addition to the public space proposed
- Contributes to a sense of civic pride
- Involves the local community
- Addresses aspects of the city's history or culture
- Recognizes the broad intent and objectives of the proposed Cultural Arts Master Plan and Livermore Public Art Policy

9. Project Management

Staff and/or representatives of the Commission will coordinate each project under the following tasks:

- Develop project descriptions and contract
- Receive necessary approvals as required
- Describe and mitigate any public safety requirements
- Facilitate artist selection processes
- Assist with budget development and identify source of funds
- Work with the Commission and the artist to develop a timeframe
- Seek relevant project consultation as needed

- Work with the artist and Staff to define long term maintenance
- Establish ownership
- Define any other relevant factors and tasks associated with a project.

Following completion this information will be added to the Public Art Register database (including photography), to be developed and maintained by Staff.

10. Range of Works

A wide range of works will be considered, for example from large scale site specific commissions to detailed handcrafted architectural features.

In developing strategies for each project the following will be considered:

- Whether the art work is to be permanent or temporal work.
- The materials to be used must be durable and vandal resistant as the public will have access to the works at all times.
- The proposed site, including usage and scale of the work.

11. Contract Procedures

Upon appointment of an artist, contractual arrangements will be made in accordance with contractual criteria established by the City of Livermore Risk Management Division.

12. Public Art Asset Management Plan

The development of a Public Art Register shall be completed to establish the extent and condition of the City's existing art work collection.

Once this work has been undertaken the next step is to develop a plan for the maintenance of existing and new works once commissioned.

13. Funding

Funding for activities proposed in the Public Art Policy is anticipated to come from a variety of sources:

- Sponsorship
- Private funding
- Budgeted funds
- Percent for Art
- Grants

14. Public Art Subcommittee

In order to ensure that the proposals meet the Public Art Policy guidelines and consistency of decision making, it is proposed that the Public Art Subcommittee continue

to send recommendations to the full Commission for approval. The Subcommittee will continue to consult people with relevant expertise as needed.

This Subcommittee will be responsible for:

- Coordinating public art activity within public spaces, including making recommendations to the Commission for the Arts on public art projects and donation proposals, and recommending to the Commission for the Arts, approval of works of art obtained through development agreements

The Subcommittee will also initiate and evaluate public art projects by:

- Reviewing proposals for projects
- Determining selection process (as described above in # 7, Selection of Artists)

15. Conservation and maintenance

An important part of the management of the city's public art work collection is the recognition of the conservation and maintenance required for both the existing and new artworks. When new works are commissioned or the Committee accepts gifts of art works the Commission must consider not only the capital costs of acquisition but also the ongoing commitment for the Commission associated with maintenance and repairs. All items recorded in the Public Art Register shall be assessed as part of the condition report and an ongoing maintenance plan formed.

Donors of items may be required to provide funds or be responsible for the maintenance and upkeep of the donated work for a designated period of time.

Where new works are commissioned or accepted written details of warranties (where these apply) detailing service should be provided with the completed work. This may cover details such as cleaning, lighting, servicing, circuit diagrams, manufacturer, and/or agents. This information should form part of the Public Art Register as well. Allowance for the cost of ongoing maintenance of new works will need to be made in the proposed Cultural Arts Master Plan.

16. Ownership

In most cases the art work will become the property of the City of Livermore. Public art may be placed on land owned by the City provided that ownership of the work is vested in the City. The ownership of art works on privately owned sites may also be transferred to the City. If the Commission accepts ownership it may be responsible for maintenance, insurance and any contractual agreement related to the art as outlined by this policy or City Council may require the site owner to be responsible for those items.

17. Documentation

All new works will be documented and this information will form part of the Public Art Registry database.

The information should include:

- Artists name, curriculum vitae, artistic statement
- Any warranties, maintenance details including name of agent and manufacturer (if applicable)
- Construction/maintenance details
- Relevant dates
- Site/display information
- Any other relevant details
- Photographic Record

INSERT MAP HERE

Table 1: Proposed Statuary Locations - ■

#	Location	Address
1	Planter Area – Thompson Gallery	2241 First Street
2	Planter Area - Sansar	2220 First Street
3	Planter Area - Sansar	2220 First Street
4	Planter Area - Music Store	2156 First Street
5	Planter Area - Ale House	2086 First Street
6	Planter Area - Strizzi's – West Side	J Street at First
7	As Opportunities Arise - Theater Plaza	First Street at McLeod
8	Pedestrian Area at this Intersection	First Street At McLeod

Table 2: Existing Public Art in the Downtown Area - ▲

#	Item	Location
3	Sundial	Carnegie Park
7	Livermore Country Wine Mural	J Street at First Street
8	Mural	L Street between Second and Third Streets
9	Lizzie Fountain	NW Corner of Livermore Avenue and First Street
10	Flag Pole Fountain	SW Corner of Livermore Avenue and First Street
11	Word Walk – Theater Plaza	First Street in Center of Livermore Valley Center
12	Metal Sculptures	Station Square

Table 3: Proposed Mural Locations - O

#	Location	Address
1	El Charro Restaurant	2020 1 st Street
2	Old Firehouse	2565 First Street
3	Main Street Designs Christmas Store	56 South Livermore Avenue
4	Old Theater Mall	2222 Second Street
5	Valley Furniture	2193 First Street
6	Forester's Hall (Second Storey, 2 nd Street side)	187 South J Street
7	Bothwell Center	2446 8 th Street
8	Trestle on Murrieta underpass to Stanley	Murrieta at Stanley
9	Top of Schenone Building	2235 First Street
10	Breezeway between Uncle Yu's and Livermore Village	39 South Livermore Avenue
11	Knodt's Flowers	2074 Second Street
12	Masonic Building	119 S. Livermore Avenue
13	Harvest Farms	112 Maple Street
14	Baughman's Building	2019 First Street
15	Top of building above Hawaii World	2056 First Street
16	Behind Real Estate Depot	186 South K Street
17	Bike Trail underpasses	Example: Livermore Avenue at Railroad Avenue
18	Harry's Hofbrau	2491 First Street

Acknowledgments

No cultural planning process happens without considerable effort on the part of the client and members of the community. We commend the Mayor and City Council for having the vision to commission this cultural plan and the foresight to make arts and culture central to the City's future. We would like to thank all the members of the Commission for the Arts, including the working group (*), for their information, time and efforts throughout the planning process.

Walter E. Davies, Chair, 2005-2006*
Lynne Freeman*, Commissioner, 2005-2006
Jean King
John Marchand, Commissioner, 2005
Katie Marcel, Commissioner, 2005-2006
Linda Ransom
Gloria Retzlaff Taylor*
Linda Ryan, Vice Chair, 2007
Nancy Elizabeth Saltsman, Vice Chair, 2005-2006*
James Schmidt*, Chair, 2007
Robbie Teruya
Laura Thournir

City staff members have also been very helpful to the consultant team in providing advice and energetic assistance. Special thanks to City Manager Linda Barton, Public Information Officer Ellyn Axelrod, Economic Development Director Kevin Roberts and especially to Chris Davidson, Redevelopment/Economic Development Coordinator, who provided the primary staff support for the planning effort, along with Clarice Douglas, Administrative Assistant. Sabrina Klein assisted with integrating the Mission, Vision and Goals of the Commission for the Arts with the Master Plan. Kathy Coyle developed the website used in the planning process. Jill Manning did an outstanding job in researching the multi-city comparative study. Finally, thanks to the many Livermore citizens who actively help shape the future of their City through this effort.

Planning Participants

Interviewees

Name	Affiliation
Janet Armantrout	Independent Newspaper
Tim Barry	General Manager, Livermore Area Recreation & Park District
Lea Blevins	Tri Valley Herald
Kim Bonde	Rodeo, Manager
Alice Calvert	City Clerk
Julie Casamajor	Librarian, Main Branch
Katie Caulk	Artist, Educator
Bill Cody	Fire Chief
David Collins	Wingspan Press and TVAG
Kathy Coyle	Cultural Diversity Fair Coordinator
Glenn Davis	TV 30, Executive Director
Gary Drummond	City's Historian
Ileana Evans	Business Owner, Artistic Masters Studio
Clay Felicitas	Police Chaplin and School District Employee
Michael Ferrucci	Business Owner, Fine Fretted Friends
Susan Gallinger	Public Library Director
Steve Harman	Director of Human Resources
Charles Hartwig	President, Cultural Arts Council
Angela Johal	President, Livermore Art Association
Andrew Johnstone	Business Owner, Artistic Masters Studio
Dale Kay	Chamber of Commerce President/CEO
Steve Krull	Police Chief
Rich Lange	Director, Livermore Community Center
Marj Leider	City Council Member
Evan Levy	Finance Services Manager
Carolyn Lord	Professional Artist
Mike Madden	Livermore Entrepreneur, LVPAC Board Member
John Marchand	City Council Member
Larry Mauch	President, Heritage Guild
Brenda Miller	LVJUSD School District Superintendent
Mary Sue Norcar	Library, Teen Projects
Connie Post	City's Poet Laureate
Kevin Roberts	Economic Development Director
Linda Ryan	Commission for the Arts
Joan Seppala	Owner & Operator of the Independent Newspaper and magazine
Lynn Siwula	Youth Commission Staff Liaison
Rachael Snedecor	Director Livermore Downtown
Paul Spence	City's Principal Planner
Dennis Swanson	Main Street Designs
Tony Trevino	Skate Shop Owner
Lisa Tromovitch	Valley Shakespeare Festival Coordinator
Eric Uranga	Housing & Human Services Manager
Lynn Wallace	Livermore Valley Wine Growers Association
Phil Wente	Wente Vineyard/LVPAC
Derek Zamrak	President/founder of CIFF

Community Workshop Participants

Name		Affiliation
Rochelle	Abrantes	Valley Dance Theatre
Ana	Aleridge	~
Janet	Armantrout	Independent Newspaper
Mark	Arnold	~
Pet	Bictoft	~
Cynthia	Bird	~
Joyce	Brown	Livermore Diversity
Paul	Brown	Livermore Diversity
Kaitlyn	Burns	~
Kean	Butterfield	Artist
Mary	Campbell	Las Positas College
Kelly	Cartwright	~
Bob & Katie	Caulk	Tri-Valley Artist Guild & Self (TVAG)
Phillida	Cheminais	Livermore Amador Symphony
Kathy	Coyle **	Livermore Diversity Celebration/Rotary
Travis M.	Dannes	~
Joe	Davis	~
Walter E.	Davis	Art Commissioner
Phillip	Dean	Livermore Valley Performing Arts Center (LVPAC)
Sedric	Dievetti	~
Gary	Drummond	City's Historian
Mel	Eckerdt	~
Jeff	Fish	Musician
Stephanie	Fish	~
Chris	Fleckner	~
C.	Foote	~
Alan	Frank	Curator of Sunol Railroad Museum
Victoria	Frehse	~
Chris	George	~
Nick	Gonzalez	~
Scott	Goodrich	~
Chris	Gordon	~
Sandi	Gutierrez	~
Bobbie	Hadley	DVFA
Dick	Hatfield	~
Joanne	Hawke	~
Nick	Hawkins	~
John	Haynes	~
Bob	Hickman	Self
Barbara	Hickman *	Commissioner
Karen	Hogan	4th Street Storytellers
Pauline	Huben	Livermore Valley Joint Unified School District
Tim & Anna	Huberd	~
Jamie	Hyams	Performing Arts Center
Diane	Jeronimo	Livermore Diversity Celebration
Angela	Johal *	LAA
Sukhjit	Johal **	Designer
Amara	Johnson	~
Gordon	Jonas	~
Sharon	Kennedy	Opera
Asale M.	Kimaada	~
Jean	King *	LCAC
Mildred	Kirkwood	~
Paul	Latter	~
Bill	Leach	Valley Concert Chorale
Suzann M.	Look	~

Kyle	Mansfield	~
Katie	Marcel *	Art Commissioner
Renee	March	Artist
John	Marchand *	Bothwell CTR/ Council Member
Melinda	Margolis	~
Diana D.	Marion *	TVAG
Noah	Marshall	~
Virginia	McFann *	Livermore Amador Symphony
Marj	McMahan	~
Don	Meeker **	Livermore Heritage Guild
Marian	Mendelsch	~
Mort	Mendelsch	LV PAC
Steven	Michaelis	Realtor, Intero Real Estate Services
Don	Miller	DVFA
Jeremy	Miller	~
Laura	Miller	~
Dan	Nelson	~
Jim	Oliver	~
Sherry	Oppenheim	Santa Clara
L	Paulson	~
Mary	Perner	~
John	Pitts *	Self
Doris	Ryan	DVFA
Grace	Ryan	High School Student
Linda	Ryan	TVAG
Tracy	Scheihing	Business Owner
Jim	Schmidt	Livermore Valley Opera (LVO)
Tania H.	Selden *	Del Valle Fine Arts / Livermore Cultural Arts Council
Joan	Seppala *	LV PAC
Lynn	Seppala *	DVFA
Barbara	Stanton	~
Clark	Streeter	Self
Dennis	Swanson	Merchant
Sherri	Swanson	Merchant
Gloria	Taylor	Art Commissioner
Ken	Williams	~
Lily	Xu *	Livermore Art Association (LAA)

* Denotes attendance at two or more workshops

Planning Methodology

Before the planning process began, the Commission for the Arts developed during 2005 its own belief and mission statements, and defined its goals. Development of the cultural arts master plan was one of the goals and a request for proposals was issued in fall 2005. The consultants were selected through a competitive bidding process and began work in February 2006.

The purpose of the planning process was in essence to allow the community to define its own cultural future. This involved an intensive and interactive community input process in which community stakeholders not only expressed their opinions but also reflected on Livermore's identity and future options. The planning process proceeded in three phases:

- I. Project Preparation
- II. Community Research
- III. Strategy and Plan Development
- IV. Commission for the Arts Analysis and Review

Phase I: Project Preparation

During February and March, the consultants reviewed relevant background information (see Relevant Plans and Studies, page 30) and attended an initial meeting with the Commission for the Arts to clarify project background and understanding. They formed a working group of Commissioners to oversee the planning process and developed a detailed project work plan and timeline to guide the efforts of consultants, staff and Commissioners during the process.

Phase II: Community Research

Between March and July, the consultants conducted a series of community workshops, town hall meetings and interviews with stakeholders. The purpose of these meetings was to assess community needs and opinions regarding Livermore's cultural development, and suggestions for accomplishing that end. Arts and culture is considered to be central to many other civic initiatives in Livermore, such as downtown redevelopment. Therefore, the definition of stakeholder groups was broad and included:

- Arts and cultural organizations, including heritage groups
- Individual artists and artisans
- Arts educators
- Education leaders
- Redevelopment agency
- Business community
- Tourism agency
- Relevant City departments
- Youth and young adults
- Laboratories

Wine growers
Local press
Cultural arts staff in nearby cities in the Tri-Valley

The consultants toured facilities and areas of Livermore and, together with staff, developed a website for the cultural plan. They also conducted a comparative study of arts funding among a cohort of nearby cities (see page 43).

Phase III: Strategy and Plan Development

Once the community research was completed, the consultants developed preliminary strategies and recommendations, and informally presented them to staff. These recommendations were developed into this draft plan, which will be presented to the community for comment and revision into a final plan. During the fall of 2006, the consultants will assist on an as-needed basis with the review and adoption of the plan and the transition to implementation.

Phase IV: Commission for the Arts Analysis and Review

Between November 2006 and February 2007, the Livermore Commission for the Arts met and extensively reviewed the recommendations of the consultants in the draft plan. With public input and through animated debate and consideration, they endorsed the core recommendations of the plan, aligned these recommendations with the beliefs and goals established by the Commission in 2005, and suggested slight modifications to ensure the plan's abilities to meet the City's immediate and long-term goals for development and quality of life.